

LAKE TOWNSHIP PLANNING COMMISSION

Unapproved Minutes

February 18, 2009

The meeting of the Lake Township Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 PM by Chairman Colletta. Members Gerry Geppert, Rich Ehrlich, Tim Lalley, Dale Hartsell and Mary Johnson also present along with approximately 45 guests.

Motion by Geppert to approve Minutes of January 28, 2008, seconded by Lalley. Motion carried – all ayes.

Minutes of January 30, 2009, were corrected to reflect the addition of the motion by Geppert, seconded by Lalley changing the regular meeting of February 25, 2009 to February 18, 2009, said motion having been approved. Motion by Hartsell to accept the minutes of January 30, 2009 with the correction, seconded by Geppert. Motion carried – all ayes.

Motion to appoint Mary Johnson as secretary to Lake Township Planning Commission; by Colletta, seconded by Ehrlich. Motion carried - all ayes

Additional items added to agenda: Under New Business; Land transfer for Opal Dufty; 2009-2010 meeting schedule; moratorium request; under old business - Kim Depner, Roadside Stand; Motion by Hartsell to accept agenda with additional items, seconded by Ehrlich. Motion carried - all Ayes.

Correspondence:

There were many letters of correspondence concerning the wind turbines proposed for Lake Township. All letters to be read from the following individuals recorded and attached to these minutes:

Letter #1: Ivoughn and Mary Depner, 2/18/09

Letter #2: John McCallum, 2/5/09

Letter #3: Mary Nowak, 2/17/09

Letter #4: Jack and Nancy Breznau, 2/17/09

Letter #5: Dennis and Darcy Mausolf, 2/17/09

Guest Speakers:

Bob Smith requested that the residential height limitation of a home be changed to 35', also lot coverage that is currently 25%, be

increased to 35%. Colletta responded that the board would take this under consideration.

Guest speaker Kurt Damrow was introduced:

He stated: The Huron County Zoning Board does not override the Lake Township Planning Commission or Zoning Board. When a zoning ordinance is proposed by a township, it is sent to Russ Lundberg for review and feedback. Steve Allen said Corporate Council will review at no charge. The Lake Township board can do what it wants with the recommendation; the County will not override the Township.

Tax revenue from Windmill Projects - many companies are getting land leases. The PA198 is a tax incentive that knocks 50% off the tax revenue. The PA198 was given up by the Governor. In Elkton, Oliver Twp., the first year revenue is about \$83,000.00 and goes down each year respectively until it is exhausted. . The Governor has made a lot of promises that have not been kept or will not be.

Damrow continues that it is possible that two years down the road a statewide royalty fee may be in effect so there may be revenue given back to the community.

He recommends research, supports landowners who decide to put wind mills on their property, and feels good about a continued revenue source in a few years.

He left maps and plat books for use by Lake Township to keep for information. Also left was a draft of Oliver Township Zoning book for review but must be returned to Mr. Damrow.

Public Comments:

Paul Beck commented that he does not know what the push is on Windmills; they are only 2% efficient. Storage is limited; the community is looking for jobs that the wind farms do not provide. However, nuclear power would provide more jobs during construction and jobs after construction is complete; a nuclear power plant employs approximately 150-250 jobs year round. Nuclear is safe, and effective, other countries are going nuclear. Very few residents with large plots benefit from windmills. The electricity will not stay in this area, or in the Detroit area for that matter.

Mrs. Przystup asked what a landowner would get for having a windmill on their property.

Kurt Damrow replied that an average windmill would get \$3,000.00 per year per turbine.

Tim Lalley commented that he had a meeting with Bob Krohn who said that he has 9 wind turbines on his property and makes \$100,000.00 per year.

Gary Bauer replied that what he has seen is \$2500.00 per turbine per year plus \$10.00 per acre multiplied by the land owned.

Lou stated that Mr. Krohn said, due to confidentiality of the contract he could not reveal the exact amount of the contract that is in place.

Mr. Damrow commented that there is the 7-15 year accelerated depreciation in place, plus the promises from the Governor to help the community replace curbs, roads, help the community in other ways to offset the cost of the turbines. He continued that he did not think the Governor would keep any one of these promises to the community, but there would be other plans in place to compensate the landowner.

Clay Kelterborn commented that he had the opportunity to talk to large land owners in Hume Township and a lot of farmers in that area are not signed up due to the inability to farm around the access roads. The farming community and Planning Commission need to be concerned about the people and the community based upon letters that have been received and the impact that the turbines have already had on them. We need to listen to what landowners say and acknowledge that the turbines create noise, light flicker and have effect on the community. He continues that we need to take a good hard look at the revenue since that money will not be there forever. "As farmers in our community we have a responsibility to our neighbors, whether they are from another county, city or state, no matter where they are from."

Mr. Steve Tait commented that he farms in Lake Township and he signed his land up for wind turbines, "I wanted to make sure that they are set back far enough from my neighbors. I want to make sure to respect my neighbors."

Kurt Damrow stated that the windmill project is in its infant stages, with manufacturing to be coming to Michigan.

Paul stated that I have first hand information on job information from Imlay City, I spoke to DTE employees who maintain windmills, and

they said that there are only 6 people who maintain windmills. If anything major goes wrong with a windmill a man is sent in from out of state to repair and maintain it.

Kurt Damrow stated that the wind project is working with Delta College and young people of Huron County to get the young community into the industry, not just locally, but nationally. They are looking at programs even in high school to train young people in wind energy and turbine production.

Tim would like Russ Lundberg to consider some of the side effects that have been brought up by the Lake Township community.

Kurt commented that Russ Lundberg would definitely take into special consideration needs of Lake Township; he will be at the Board Meeting sometime in March.

Lou Colletta asked if Oliver Township has 32 windmills up for one year, how did they just come up with the draft.

Kurt responded that the draft has been in progress and in place.

Lou responded that he has seen the Oliver Township minutes and there is no mention of any ordinance.

Valerie McCallum stated that at the planning commission meeting last year at the State Park Bob Krohn said that they did not have an ordinance yet.

Mr. Gene Champagne stated the Oliver Township Board and planning board are finally getting formal complaints and that may have helped to get the ordinance speeded up. He stated he was hearing good things and he was listening to people sharing with Lake Township, talking with neighbors, everyone is not all good with the Harvest Wind farms, noise, setbacks. He can relate to living on a wind farm. He continued that he feels good that he is finally sharing his opinion about the negative aspects of wind farms.

Lou stated to Mr. Smith that this is why this is taking so long to get this to go. Everyone is telling us to take our time. Oliver Township had nothing to work with.

Valerie stated that she would like to agree with the nuclear energy aspect that was brought up earlier. Nuclear power producing 1000 megawatts takes up 300 sq. ft. as compared to 200 square miles for a wind farm producing the same. . She proceeded to read portions of

a letter from Mr. Larry Wunsch, dated 1/2/2009. This letter is recorded and attached to these minutes.

Kurt responded to the letter: he talked to engineers and by putting different tips on the ends of the blades of the turbines and implementing different engineering, some of the problems, like flickering, may be eliminated. With Lake Township having so much information to work with, Lake Township is very fortunate. Out of 83 counties in Michigan, Huron County is in good shape.

Lou stated that Governor Granholm has mentioned putting wind farms on the Great Lakes.

Valerie stated that she would like to see the Planning Commission do more research on what is going on in Europe; they are all decommissioning wind farms and going for nuclear power

Kurt Damrow stated that DTE is already working on nuclear power, solar power, and water. We're not looking at the entire Township to be covered with windmills.

Steve Tate stated he does not think DTE is the problem, or the land owner. It's who we elect for government that is the problem; it's what is mandated by the government.

Clay asked if there was not a state mandate, would DTE be looking at wind for energy?

Bob Siver commented that we should have the maximum sensitivity to the people of Lake Township, those who will be living next to the turbines.

Lou stated we are taking into consideration health, safety and property values. Setbacks are very important; we don't know what's going to happen with the economy and property values.

John Depner stated that he appreciates the work the board has put into the project. The talk tonight has been more open and fair. We are a narrow Township, 2 miles wide and 6 miles long with shoreline, wildlife, birds, Rush Lake and that leaves us with very little to work with. One of the primary reasons was to preserve farm land.

Valerie stated that when Kurt mentioned nuclear, we are not here to re-invent the wheel; there are countries that have had wind farms a lot longer than we have. We have a responsibility to our community

to do the research. The wind turbines are costly, do not create jobs, and have health risks. We need to look at alternatives that create more jobs and revenue in the long run.

Kurt stated that we cannot tell people what to do with their property. Just have everyone look at these maps, sit down with people and show them maps, where homes are, you may find out you are way beyond Oliver Township.

Tim stated we have already mapped out where wind turbines will go. and asked how DTE would handle different ordinances between Townships that span across each other?

Matt Wagner stated that the thought process is respect for landowners, residents, wildlife. Mike Serafin of DTE stated that they will always opt to place a turbine the farthest away from a home that an ordinance and geography will allow by looking at that particular situation.

Tim asked what DTE considers a safe setback?

Matt Wagner responded that DTE is starting a pre-construction noise study.

Kurt stated we will need to take into consideration our campgrounds and county parks.

John Depner stated that if 35-40 go into Lake Township with more in Chandler, Meade and Hume to a total of 200 windmills, and there is a vision of 1500 to 2000 wind turbines in Huron County; no matter where you stand you will see one.

Clay asked DTE how DTE would respond to the individual negative impacts such as Gene Champagne's?

Matt Wagner responded that they would treat it individually and on an individual basis, it would be up to the individual.

Paul Beck stated that not only is DTE competing for the wind, the present administration is promising that we will be getting this and that and the next administration might cut us off from all of the funding.

Kurt responded that anything is possible.

Tim asked DTE how many acres they have leased in Huron County and how many wind turbines they anticipate per acre?

Matt Wagner responded 56,000 acres, 1 turbine per 125 acres

Gerry Geppert mentioned a private windmill in Sebewaing.

Kurt said there was a 2 year study of wind turbines to see how they impact the environment.

Lou stated that we are trying to put private wind energy systems for residential use in the ordinance.

Dan Depner stated we have one man sitting here that has been negatively affected by having wind turbines too close to his home. Hopefully it is early enough to make the right choices, not just in our Township, but our County. What recourse will we have if we do not make the right choices; I see we have two choices. Make the right choices in the beginning or make decisions in haste and effect many people and be back here in a year's time with many people with health effects. What will be built into your Ordinance for the non-participating property owner? Do we know what recourse the property owner will have. It is in every one's best interest in this room to make the best decision. I would hope Huron County, the Commissioners and Lake Township Planning Commission, because we all live here, are asking if even one or a few people are affected, is that O.K. with us? Or if we throw enough money at it will it be O.K.?

DTE responded they would try to avoid that situation, if not; we will work with that person after the fact.

Lou stated where does that liability lie, with the Township or the utility?

Motion for 5 minute break by Colletta, seconded by Geppart, all ayes.

Meeting resumed at 9:15p.m.

New Business

Opal Duffy –
Land split. Site plan check then goes to the Township Board.

Roadside Stand: Depner

Lou talked to MTA, called Ray Township, looked up Township Ordinance. There seems to be a roadside stand on every corner. They cannot sell anything from a roadside stand that was purchased from another or sold from another store. Anything sold from a roadside stand must be made or grown on that property.

Old Business

RR District building review, Ordinance ready for recommendation. Lou made motion for recommendation, Gerry second, 4 ayes, 1 nay.

Interior Light Packet for consideration for Township Planning Board to review, see what's applicable, next meeting for consideration.

Calendar for upcoming meetings:

25 March 2009	27 Jan 2010
22 April 2009	24 Feb 2010
27 May 2009	24 Mar 2010
24 June 2009	
22 July 2009	
26 Aug 2009	
23 Sept 2009	
28 Oct 2009	

No meetings Nov or Dec 2009

Mining and Mineral Extraction tabled until next meeting.

Motion to adjourn by Gerry, seconded by Dale. Motion carried – all ayes. Meeting adjourned at 9:56p.m.

Mary Johnson, Secretary

Letters Below

-----Original Message-----

From: Ivoughn Depner [mailto:ivoughn@depner.com]
Sent: Sunday, February 15, 2009 7:06 PM
To: loudor15@comcast.net
Subject: Lake Twp. turbines

Dear Lake Township Planning Board,

This letter is concerning the wind turbines proposed for Lake township. Alternative energy is a fine goal, but when it has great impact on a community then it should be beneficial to all.

As a resident of this township, I'm concerned with the possible health issues. From articles I've read, there can be problems especially for people with existing health issues. I've had equilibrium problems in the past, so changes in air pressure, movement, and vibrations can cause me difficulties. My Mother who is elderly and resides here as well, has many health issues including head aches and much difficulty sleeping.

Here are some of our questions.

1. Is it fair to bring in objects to the community that may make residents suffer distress?
2. If a resident has health problems (relating to the turbines) and they have little or no health insurance, will the turbine owner or township pay for their medical bills? If there are long term health problems, who is responsible?
3. If a resident is forced to move, will they have a guarantee of receiving 'pre-turbine' property values?
4. Are the wind turbines a real benefit to our community as a whole bringing unity, good health, and prosperity to all?

It's understandable for land leasers to want the turbines closer to their homes, but it seems unfair to make their neighbors suffer with health problems or noise and light issues. (If we wanted those things, we would live in a large city.)

Anyway, we don't think that setbacks to any non-participating residents should be any closer than 1 mile or more, unless they have written permission from the neighbors.

We hope you will consider all of these issues.

Thank you,

Ivoughn and Mary Depner
Conkey Road Lake Twp.

John P. McCallum
8800 Myrtle Drive
Cassville, MI 48725
Mobile: 906-370-8118

February 5, 2009

Robert T. Smith, Supervisor
Lake Township Hall
P.O. Box 429
4088 W. Kinde Rd.
Cassville, MI 48725-0429

Dear Mr. Smith,

As an owner of a Lake Township home, I am requesting that the Lake Township elected officials investigate the idea of property tax reduction from the revenue generated by future wind turbines placed in Lake Township. Just as Alaska citizens receive benefits from the oil industry, we too should be compensated for allowing our township to be used as a platform for generating electricity. There should be a number of ways this can be accomplished and still satisfy current property tax law while eliminating double dipping by land owners that will be receiving income from the wind turbines.

This is a good opportunity for you and the planning commission to show the Lake Township citizens that the new leadership is committed to tax relief for all. I am sure Lake Township citizens would expect at a minimum, a verbal statement at the February Township meeting that this will receive the attention it deserves along with a schedule as to when action on this matter will begin.

To assist the Township, I am offering to develop a questionnaire for every citizen to complete. To assure our neighbors that the Township is looking into this matter, we can include the transcripts from the February meeting.

This is an exciting time in the energy business and it is imperative that our elected officials recognize now to achieve fairness and tax relief for our citizens when our natural resources and environment are being used to generate revenue for industry. I will eagerly await your response to this letter and will assist the Township in anyway possible to achieve a positive outcome for all Lake Township tax payors.

Thank you,


John P. McCallum

Transmitted via e-mail in PDF format to the Lake Township Hall on 2-5-09 in addition to a signed copy to the Hall on 2-5-09.

E-MAILED
2-5-09
TO HALL
COPY
MAILED TO CLERK AT
HOME ADDRESS

-----Original Message-----

From: Mary Nowak [mailto:marynowak@comcast.net]
Sent: Tuesday, February 17, 2009 7:51 PM
To: londorl5@comcast.net
Subject: Wind Turbines

TO: The Lake Township Planning Board.

I am requesting that this email to you be included in your meeting and this email saved and details be included in the minutes for public record.

I heard about your meeting to discuss wind turbines in your area and I would like to tell you how I feel about this. We were approached to be a buffer for windmills by our town of Ubyly. After talking with the representative of Noble Wind Turbines, I could tell that he was not being honest with me. I could see it in his eyes and he was evasive about answering my questions.

After saying no to being a buffer (which would have been \$3,000 a year to us) myself and my husband decided that it was not a good thing, as it to compromise the peaceful life that our small town gave us. I am talking the about the noise that they would produce.

We live on M-19 1/2 mile north of Ubyly and there are 3 turbines behind our house. One to the north, one right behind and one to the south. I am not sure how far away they are but would have to be 400 feet from our property line so I am calculating 1600 feet away or so.

I have been documenting on a chart that I created the noise that I will have to listen to when summer comes and I open my windows. I do not hear them from inside the house when it is closed up for the winter.

However, I step outside onto my back porch each morning and record what is are running and the wind direction and what sound that I hear. If the wind is from the west I hear jets going over in the west and depending on the wind speed, so is the jet sound, soft, medium and loud. If the wind is blowing from the east there is a swish sound with each blade. I have not heard this too often because in winter the wind is mostly northwest and southwest. Jet sounds are almost daily if the wind is above the low speed. East wind usually comes in the fall of the year, when I love to walk my

property and enjoy the colorful fall flowers that I plan behind my barn and the trees back there. I have a feeling I will not enjoy this as the east wind will be blowing and swish, swish, swish, will be going with the fall wind.

I personally don't think this is fair to the people of this community nor myself. I fear that I will grow to hate the sounds that it makes.

I believe that there is an ultrasound that we cannot hear and they are proving that these wind turbines do produce this sound as I write this letter, they are proving it. Yet, no one seems to believe that this is true, even our president who will put up more of these turbines with our billions of tax money.

I don't believe they are very efficient as Edison is again trying to raise our rates as I have seen they have a hearing in the paper inviting us all to come and accept this. I know it is for the windmills. I believe by the hearing in the paper this will raise our bills about \$20.00 by 2012. We were told that we would not get raise increases due to the wind turbines, I knew this wasn't true. I was right.

If you can avoid having these wind turbines near your town try to do so, you may not win because our government doesn't seem to care about the people near them. But don't delay to learn all you can about these huge turbines, sight, sound, property values, etc. After being put up the jobs are not there anymore. It is not going to stimulate many jobs.

Thank you for listening and I wish the people of Lake Township good luck in not having to put up with these things that destroy our quiet beautiful environment. Even my dog is afraid when put outside and she hears the jets.

Sincerely and honestly said

Mary Nowak
4234 N. Washington
Uhly, Mi. 48475

From: nancy breznau [mailto:nancy.breznau@comcast.net]
Sent: Tuesday, February 17, 2009 4:46 PM
To: louder15@comcast.net
Subject: wind turbines

sent us your email encouraging us to add our input to the discussion and planning for wind turbines. We think they are great; but should not be installed any closer than 1 mile from any residence. Some people are more sensitive than others; consequently care should be taken where they are installed. Thanks, Jack and Nancy Breznau

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday, February 17, 2009 6:37 PM
To: loudor15@comcast.net; Dennis and Darcy
Subject: Lake Township Planning Board

I am writing to give you are personal perspective living within a windfarm. We live near 4 wind tubines, the closest being 1100' away. Our experience so far has been if are down wind from a turbine they make a considerable amount of noise. Also trees and buildings noticeably amplify the sound. Outside it sounds like jet noise with a intermitent swoosh. Inside it sound like a truck running outside. In the evening on a sunny day when the blades begin to flicker the incoming light, it is similar to someone turning the lights on and off. We live in a nice ranch style home that we have invested our life savings into. It will never be worth what it was. The quiet countryside is gone. As far as jobs go, we have been told about the jobs that the windfarm will bring. Most are transient workers that follow the construction from state to state. The gravel and concrete work that hires most local workers last 3 to 4 weeks. In conclusion, your decision is not an easy one, but remember we all live in the same county and we should all be treated equally in these descions. Thank you for your time and you are welcome to take a look for yourself if you so wish.

Dennis and Darcy Mausolf
1505 East Atwater Rd
Ubly, MI 48475

Dear Jim Lepinski,

It has been almost a year now since the Forward Energy wind turbines have went on line. I have tried to keep an open mind and change the way I have looked at wind farms, but it doesn't look like it's going to happen. I have seen a number of homes in this wind farm go up for sale. Some of the homes are live in by people that were born and raise here this township, but because of the issues from the wind turbines, they said it just doesn't feel like home any more. The homes for sale in our township that are in the wind farm project have not or still have not been sold. In more than one case, the prospective buyers have stated that they were uncomfortable living so close to a wind turbine or just did not want to live so close to a wind turbines in general. I guess so much for the submitted REPP study that states property values actually go up inside wind farms. I always wondered why the attorney for Forward Energy told the Town of Byron Board of Appeals that if they had to provide adjacent non-hosting land owners with a property value protection agreement, that the company would not be able to get financing for the wind farm. Months ago I sent you a DVD with some of my complaints but have not heard anything back. Use this link if you need to be refreshed.

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iyOImG1lyJtQ>

Shadow Flicker

Invernergy told the PSC and Dodge County Board of Appeals that shadow flicker was minimal. With a modeling software they could almost eliminate this. This is BS. I get shadow flicker for 6 weeks in the fall and 6 weeks in the spring. As you can see from the video this is not minimal. Have someone in your home consistently turn the lights on and off and see if you can concentrate on a something like reading.

Noise

People who state that wind turbines are very quiet are probably good candidates for a lobotomy. I have not slept with the windows open on my house since the turbines have went on line. There are days when it sounds like a jet engine idling on an airport taxi-way. There are other days when the noise is so intense, we can hear them through the walls of our home. Don't come to me with the 50 decibel thing. I am not a sound expert so I can argue this. All as I know, I was told is that they don't hardly ever hear them. Just another lie.

Ice throws

I remember this one well. Joel Link at Dodge County hearings along with Mark Jacobson stating the this type of new designed turbine does not have ice build up on its blades, and if it should the turbine would shut down. I was plowing snow in my driveway on December 23rd when I noticed out of the corner of my eye what looked like a bed sheet diving to the ground. After the second time this happened, I figured it out. The turbine

was shedding a ice/snow mix and the second one landed just short of my property line. I will tell you this, that if this event in the future should cause property of bodily harm, I will be out for blood. If you don't believe me about the ice/snow build up, see for yourself. <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4EmYe2u6J6g>

Where do I go from here,

I can't complain anymore to the Town chairman. He stated in an interview with Ted Perry from Channel six in Milwaukee that the town residents that are complaining about the wind farms issues are implants in the town and not good stand-by people. So I am wasting my breath talking to this clown and the other two morons. I can't complain to my State Reps because they have told us that it's a local issue and not within their control, but yet the state creates a law which the wind companies use to force their way into a community to erect turbines and destroy the community atmosphere. Then us a model ordinance that was drafted by (guess who) energy company officials to address concerns. I would be wasting my time talking to Invenergy people like Mick Baird, Joel Link and Mark Jacobson who basically never addressed concerns early in the project design and have told town residents that I and others are just a trouble makers.

So here I am typing this letter to you. I don't know of any other way at this time to enforce what a poor decision this has been on the part of the PSC. I am shocked that the Public Service Commission didn't place parameters in this project to protect me and other residents within the wind farm project. I don't want to hear the Not In My Back Yard thing. Do any of the PSC commissioners have a wind turbine 1100 feet from their home, or does any State Rep have a wind turbine 1100 feet from his/her home. Best yet, do you know of an energy company official with a wind turbine 1100' from his/her home? I didn't think so. Let's focus on the truth, this isn't about renewable energy, it's about money. This is just another scam were an LLC develops something to take advantage of subsidized money to stuff millions in their pockets. I am not sure where this is all going in the future, but I know this has taken away a quality of my life. This is why residents of Wisconsin don't trust the judgment of the PSC or their own State Reps. I hope the PSC learns and not bends to the pressure of lobbyists.

Larry Wunsch
Brownsville, Wisconsin
(920) 583-2210